

**MINUTES OF AN ADJOURNED REGULAR
MEETING OF THE TORRANCE CITY COUNCIL**

1. CALL TO ORDER

The Torrance City Council convened in an adjourned regular meeting at 5:34 p.m. on May 24, 2005, in Council Chambers.

ROLL CALL

Present: Councilmembers Lieu, McIntyre, Mauno, Nowatka, Scotto, Witkowsky, and Mayor Walker.

Absent: None.

Also Present: City Manager Jackson, City Attorney Fellows, City Clerk Herbers and other staff representatives.

17. EXECUTIVE SESSION

The Council immediately recessed to closed session to confer with the City Manager and the City Attorney on the agenda matters listed under 17.A) Conference with Labor Negotiator; and 17.B) Conference with Legal Counsel – Existing Litigation pursuant to California Government Code Sections 54957.6 and 54956.9(a).

The City Council reconvened at 7:14 p.m.

2. FLAG SALUTE/INVOCATION

The Pledge of Allegiance was led by Councilmember McIntyre.

The invocation was given by Councilmember Scotto.

3. AFFIDAVIT OF POSTING/WAIVE FURTHER READING

MOTION: Councilmember Mauno moved to accept and file the report of the City Clerk on the posting of the agenda for this meeting. The motion was seconded by Councilmember Lieu and a voice vote reflected unanimous approval.

MOTION: Councilmember Mauno moved that after the City Clerk has read aloud the number and title to any resolution or ordinance on the meeting agenda, the further reading thereof shall be waived, reserving and guaranteeing to each Councilmember the right to demand the reading of any such resolution or ordinance in regular order. The motion was seconded by Councilmember Lieu and a roll call vote reflected unanimous approval.

4. WITHDRAWN OR DEFERRED ITEMS

City Manager Jackson indicated that item 7H had been withdrawn to be brought back at a later date and he noted that the Water Commission wanted to comment on item 7F.

5. COUNCIL COMMITTEE MEETINGS AND ANNOUNCEMENTS

City Manager Jackson announced the Budget workshops would be held at the City Council meetings of June 7 at 6:00 p.m. and June 14 at 7:00 p.m. with the budget hearing scheduled for June 21 at 7:00 p.m.

Mayor Walker announced that memorial services would be held for Tom Whittle on Thursday, May 27 at Rice Mortuary on Torrance Boulevard.

6. COMMUNITY MATTERS

6A. PROCLAMATION RE TORRANCE FARMER'S MARKET DAY

Proclamation declaring June 7, 2005 as ***Torrance Farmers' Market Day*** in the City of Torrance and encouraging all to attend and join in the celebration recognizing the Market's 20th anniversary.

Councilmember Witkowsky presented the proclamation to Toni Sargent, Tony D'Acquisto, Dutch and Betty Holland, Irene Iwasaka, Eve Taillon, Jerrie Watkins, Renee Gordan, and Mary Lou Weiss who thanked the Council for their support.

7. CONSENT CALENDAR

Item 7H was withdrawn and item 7F was pulled for separate consideration.

7A. COUNCIL DARK NIGHTS THROUGH JANUARY 3, 2006

Recommendation

Recommendation of the **City Manager** that City Council consider the following Tuesdays as City Council dark nights through January 3, 2006: July 5, 2005; August 30, 2005; September 6, 2005; November 29, 2005; December 27, 2005 and January 3, 2006.

7B. FINAL TRACT MAP NO. 54013 RE PE VENTURES SUBDIVISION

Recommendation

Recommendation of the **Community Development** Director that City Council:

- 1) Approve Final Tract Map No. 54013, creating a 13-unit residential condominium project on one lot, located at 1226 Engracia Avenue, which was subdivided by PE Ventures, LLC, and substantially conforms to and meets all conditions of approval of the Tentative Map; and
- 2) Accept a 10' corner cut-off easement for alley purposes at the southwest corner of the lot.

7C. FINAL TRACT MAP NO. 54014 RE PE VENTURES SUBDIVISION

Recommendation

Recommendation of the **Community Development Director** that City Council:

- 1) Approve Final Tract Map No. 54014, creating an 11-unit residential condominium project on Lot 1 and commercial retail/office project on Lot 2, which was subdivided by PE Ventures, LLC. The project is located at 1321 Post Avenue, and substantially conforms to and meets all conditions of approval of the Tentative Map; and
- 2) Accept a 10' corner cut-off easement for alley purposes at the northeast corner of the lot.

7D. CHANGE ORDER RE JUST REWARDS FOR RIDESHARE INCENTIVE GIFTS

Recommendation

Recommendation of the **Human Resources Director** that City Council authorize a change order in the amount of \$20,000 to the existing Just Rewards purchase order (PO # 19727) to provide rideshare incentive gift certificates in support of the City's Rideshare Program through the remainder of Fiscal Year 2004-2005, for a new not-to-exceed amount of \$120,000.

7E. O.C. TANNER PURCHASE ORDER RE EMPLOYEE SERVICE AWARDS

Recommendation

Recommendation of the **Human Resources Director** that City Council approve a purchase order with O.C. Tanner for an amount not to exceed \$35,000 for the purchase of employee service awards during the Fiscal Year 2005-2006.

7F. PROPOSED WORK PLAN – WATER COMMISSION

Recommendation

Recommendation of the **Public Works Director** and the **Water Commission** that City Council review and approve the Commission's proposed Work Plan.

CONSIDERED SEPARATELY – SEE PAGE 5

7G. SEA CLEAR POOLS CONTRACT RENEWAL RE BENSTEAD PLUNGE

Recommendation

Recommendation of the **General Services Director** that City Council authorize a contract renewal with Sea Clear Pools for the annual pool maintenance of the Benstead Plunge for \$32,539.50 for Fiscal Year 2005-2006.

7H. GRAFFITI PROTECTIVE COATINGS CONTRACT

Recommendation

Recommendation of the **General Services Director** that City Council authorize a contract with Graffiti Protective Coatings, Inc., for Fiscal Year 2005-2006 for graffiti removal services (B2005-23) in the City of Torrance at a cost not to exceed \$220,000 with annual options to extend the contract up to 5 years.

7I. PARDESS AIR INC. CONTRACT RE CITY SERVICES BUILDING

Recommendation

Recommendation of the **General Services Director** that City Council award a contract to Pardess Air Inc. (B2005-12) for \$72,000 with a 5% contingency of \$3,600 for the replacement of five (5) air conditioning units (FEAP #182) and twenty three (23) exhaust fans (FEAP #181) at the City Services Building at the City Yard.

7J. PURCHASE ORDER RE SCHAIERS NISSAN OF LONG BEACH

Recommendation

Recommendation of the **General Services Director** that City Council authorize the award of a purchase order to Schaiers Nissan of Long Beach located in Signal Hill, CA (B2005-19) in the amount of \$66,617.27 including sales tax, to furnish three (3) 2005 Nissan Altima SE 4-Door Sedans.

7K. PURCHASE ORDER RE MANHATTAN BEACH TOYOTA

Recommendation

Recommendation of the **General Services Director** that City Council authorize the award of a purchase order to Manhattan Beach Toyota of Manhattan Beach, CA (B2005-21) in the amount of \$25,902.15 including sales tax, to furnish one (1) 2005 Toyota Sienna LE van.

7L. PURCHASE ORDER RE SCOTT ROBINSON HONDA

Recommendation

Recommendation of the **General Services Director** that City Council authorize the award of a purchase order to Scott Robinson Honda of Torrance, CA (B2005-18) in the amount of \$45,493.32 including sales tax, to furnish two (2) 2005 Honda Accord LX 4-Door sedans for use by the Torrance Police Department.

7M. SUBTENANT LEASES RE SKYPARK DRIVE

Recommendation

Recommendation of the **Land Management Team** that City Council consent to the following sub-tenant leases at 2780 Skypark for the development known as the Airport Atrium (C89-007):

- 1) Primarion, Inc., a Delaware Corporation; and
- 2) LiveOffice Corporation, a California Corporation and wholly-owned subsidiary of LiveOffice Holdings Corporation.

7N. APRIL MONTHLY INVESTMENT REPORT

Recommendation

Recommendation of the **City Treasurer** that City Council accept and file the monthly investment report for the month of April 2005.

7O. SELF CHECK-OUT SYSTEM – KATY GEISSERT CIVIC CENTER LIBRARY

Recommendation

Recommendation of the **Community Services Director** that City Council approve the sole source purchase of self check-out system equipment from 3M Library Services in the amount of \$104,610.48 for the Katy Geissert Civic Center Library.

7P. 2003 COPS GRANT FUND INTEREST ALLOCATION TO COMMUNITY RELATIONS PROGRAM OPERATIONS

Recommendation

Recommendation of the **Chief of Police** that City Council appropriate and allocate \$1,771.20 in accrued interest from the 2003 COPS grant to fund continued operations of the Community Relations program approved for this grant.

7Q. AGREEMENT RE S & J CHEVROLET FOR TORRANCE TRANSIT BUSES

Recommendation

Recommendation of the **Transit Director** that City Council approve and authorize the Mayor to execute and the City Clerk to attest to a two-year contract services agreement with S & J Chevrolet to repair and rebuild the Allison Transmissions of Torrance Transit buses for an annual cost not to exceed \$50,000.

7R. AGREEMENT RE VALLEY POWER SYSTEMS FOR TORRANCE TRANSIT BUSES

Recommendation

Recommendation of the **Transit Director** that City Council approve and authorize the Mayor to execute and the City Clerk to attest to a two-year contract services agreement with Valley Power Systems (VPS) to repair and rebuild the Detroit Diesel bus engines and the Allison Transmissions of Torrance Transit buses for an annual cost not to exceed \$25,000.

MOTION: Councilmember Witkowski moved to approve items 7A through 7E, item 7G, and items 7I through 7R as written. Councilmember Scotto seconded the motion and a roll call vote reflected unanimous approval.

Item 7H was withdrawn and Item 7F was considered separately.

7F. PROPOSED WORK PLAN – WATER COMMISSION

Recommendation

Recommendation of the **Public Works Director** and the **Water Commission** that City Council review and approve the Commission's proposed Work Plan.

Kay White, Chair of the Water Commission, called attention to the Commission's work on the Water Plan noting that the main focus of the plan is on water conservation. The Commission will be looking at water rate policies and water conservation issues especially in the General Plan and they will be doing community outreach and education with the help of the Metropolitan Water District.

MOTION: Councilmember Nowatka moved to approve item 7F. Councilmember Scotto seconded the motion and a roll call vote reflected unanimous approval.

9. PLANNING AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

9A. LOS ANGELES AIR FORCE BASE REGIONAL ALLIANCE PUBLIC CAMPAIGN CONTRIBUTION

Recommendation of the **City Manager** that City Council:

- 1) Contribute an additional \$35,000 to the Los Angeles Air Force Base Regional Alliance (Alliance) public campaign to retain the Los Angeles Air Force Base (LAAFB); and
- 2) Appropriate \$35,000 from the Economic Development Reserve.

Financial Note: The Alliance, d.b.a. the South Bay Area Chamber of Commerce 501(c)6, utilizes Mellon 1 st Business Bank and the accounting firm of Johnson Thomas Associates. In order to maintain the financial integrity of the Alliance, both financial institutions are not affiliated with any current SBCOG, SBACC, or SBEDP business. The financial activities of the accounts will be reported to the Chairs of the Regional Alliance Committee.

Councilmember Lieu indicated that he had initiated the item as the list does not become final for six more months. He felt it important to do anything possible to save the base and the alliance needs more money to finish the final part of the battle.

MOTION: Councilmember Lieu moved to accept the staff recommendation. Councilmember Witkowski seconded the motion and a roll call vote reflected unanimous approval.

Councilmember Lieu thanked the Council for the contribution which brings the total contribution by Torrance to \$100,000 and he challenged other South Bay cities to contribute as well to work to keep the base open.

Councilmember Nowatka commented that said it was tough to approve the expenditure as the city faces major cutbacks but there were funds available which did not strip other funds. He expressed concern that the base could be closed as the Chairman of the BRAC Commission noted that there would be changes to the current closures.

11. ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS

11A. LETTER OF OPPOSITION RE AB 1331

Recommendation of the **Human Resources Director** that City Council concur with staff's recommendation to oppose AB1331 and direct staff to forward a letter of opposition to State Legislators.

Human Resources Administrator Rizzo summarized the material of record on the bill relating to Workers' compensation apportionment and presumptions.

MOTION: Councilmember McIntyre moved to accept the staff recommendation. Councilmember Scotto seconded the motion and the discussion continued.

Mayor Walker noted difficulty with recommendations that direct law to impact specific groups of people and he did not want to negatively affect police and fire. He was skeptical that a letter from the City of Torrance would receive much attention and he did not want to be on record going in that direction.

Councilmember Mauno questioned whether the legislative subcommittee usually discussed this type of matter and Mayor Walker responded that most of the time there is a recommendation. City Manager Jackson concurred that either approach was appropriate.

Councilmember Lieu shared the Mayor's view and felt the bill would help police and fire and he did not think the city should oppose the bill because police and fire are in unique occupations which create extra stress. He pointed out that the person who spearheaded the bill was in the military and the bill has been widely supported.

Motion failed. AYES: Councilmembers McIntyre, Nowatka and Scotto. NOES: Councilmembers Lieu, Mauno, Witkowski and Mayor Walker.

11B. REVISED ORGANIZATIONAL STRUCTURE AND FUNDING STRATEGY RE COMMUNITY SERVICES DEPARTMENT

Recommendation of the **Community Services Director** and the **Community Services Steering Committee** that City Council approve the organizational structure and funding strategy as revised for the new Community Services Department and take the following actions:

- 1) Reorganize part-time hours in Recreation Services and Parks and Recreation Administration;
- 2) Accept self-automation savings;
- 3) Reclassify 5 Library Assistant 1 positions in the Library to part-time positions;
- 4) Delete one Sr. Recreation Supervisor position;
- 5) Downgrade the 2 proposed management positions to supervisor positions; and

- 6) Establish a one year review period that allows the Community Services Director to form a Department Subcommittee that studies the appropriate classification level of the Principal Librarian positions rather than one and makes a final recommendation to Council, complete with a funding strategy, for any necessary adjustments to the long term structure of the Torrance Public Library.

Community Services Director Barnett provided a summary of the material of record and indicated that supplemental material was available including a letter of support from the Senior Librarians and organizational charts reflecting the recommended revisions.

Senior Analyst Witzansky highlighted the details of the recommended action and presented organizational charts to illustrate the proposed changes to structure. He noted that the final action is the recommendation to create a department subcommittee to study the long term structure of the library. There is concern amongst the director, steering committee and library staff that there may be a need for two principal librarian positions rather than one and that the appropriate classification may be at the management level rather than at the supervisory level so if long term changes are necessary they will return with a funding strategy to pay for it.

Jeannie Moorman, President of TME-AFSCME Local 1117, received clarification that the Council had received her letter and she expressed concern about deleting five full time positions to be replaced with part time junior librarian positions as the savings appear insignificant compared to the major impact of the change on staff and public service. She recommended they accept and approve consolidation savings of \$296,050 minus the reclassification of library assistants and if the council did not agree with that she asked that they defer this portion to the committee that is part of the recommendation and have them look at alternatives to make up those cost savings. Ms. Moorman submitted a letter signed by 14 library employees opposing the matter.

Responding to Councilmember McIntyre, Ms. Mormon explained Library Assistant job functions noting that the position required much training. She pointed out that there were already about 50 part time employees but the transitory nature of part time employment creates a high attrition rate requiring constant training, retraining and monitoring. She acknowledged a few part timers who have stayed a long time but noted that Library Pages now have to be recruited every six months and she did not feel that the costs associated with having to retrain and monitor had been taken into account.

Responding to Councilmember Witkowsky, Senior Analyst Witzansky explained that the five Library Assistant I positions were scattered throughout the system and he clarified that the hierarchy in the system could provide some of the training but centralized departmental training was being considered to create efficiency there.

Councilmember Witkowsky expressed concern with the public losing good services at the counter and she felt the branch libraries had less traffic. Senior Analyst Witzansky received clarification that she preferred focusing cuts on the branches rather than the Katy Geissert library and he noted that staff preferred to make the cuts through attrition and there would be four vacancies in the near future which they would use to explore the model.

Councilmember Witkowsky suggested that those branches with Senior Librarians could be used to assist Library Assistants as they come and go and Senior Analyst

Witzansky commented that could result in part time staff at the facility by themselves calling the main library for assistance from other full time staff members there.

Ms. Moorman indicated that Library Assistants are often left to supervise the branch and other staff so deleting them could pose a problem as that position is often in charge of the building and reference services on Saturdays and evenings meaning those functions would be done by part time, untrained, entry level employees diluting the level of service. She added that Library Assistants do a lot of technical entry, and cataloging information at the main library and they can not be easily replaced by entry-level, untrained high school kids.

Senior Analyst Witzansky acknowledged that there would be occasion where a branch library facility would be managed entirely by part time workers and he added that Palos Verdes and others open branch libraries with only part time staff members. He felt that while a level of professionalism would be lost, the benefits outweigh the drawbacks because additional staff hours would plug the holes in the system.

Councilmember Nowatka stated that losing 15 full time employees through attrition would result in 10 more part time employees with an end result of 25 employees and Senior Analyst Witzansky indicated that would result in a 50% increase in hours. He noted that while some employees remain long term, most part timers do come and go more quickly but Recreation Services has successfully relied upon part time staff members using training and positive supervision to provide a good quality of service.

Ms. Moorman commented that not very many part timers last very long.

Responding to Councilmember Lieu, Senior Analyst Witzansky explained that the committee and director would be coming back with downgraded positions to perform Library Services Manager functions with supervisory personnel resulting in a net loss of management positions.

Councilmember Lieu questioned whether replacing full time positions with 15 part time would make the job harder and Senior Analyst Witzansky explained that the Library Assistant II positions would feel the losses, not management and he noted that they were not committed on a long term basis to only one principal librarian.

City Manager Jackson stated that the action would stretch the span of control but would be doable in structure and would extend the number of supervisors.

Mayor Walker observed that the changes made significant progress with regard to budget savings by moving forward and he supported the item with the exception of deleting the five positions as he did not like the idea of replacing trained employees with lots of part time employees.

Councilmember Lieu commented that management had done a good job of creating cost savings and if the five positions were not eliminated a savings of almost \$300,000 would still be achieved. He felt that deleting the five positions would be reducing quality for quantity.

MOTION: Councilmember Lieu moved to concur the staff recommendation to reorganize part-time hours in Recreation Services and Parks and Recreation Administration, accept self-automation savings, delete one Sr. Recreation Supervisor position, downgrade the 2 proposed management positions to supervisor positions, and establish a one year

review period that allows the Community Services Director to form a Department Subcommittee that studies the appropriate classification level of the Principal Librarian positions rather than one and makes a final recommendation to Council, complete with a funding strategy, for any necessary adjustments to the long term structure of the Torrance Public Library. The proposal to reclassify 5 Library Assistant 1 positions in the Library to part-time positions is to be studied further and brought back to City Council with alternative options.

Responding to Councilmember Witkowski, City Manager Jackson explained that staff would explore how to make up the shortfall.

A roll call vote reflected unanimous approval.

11C. UNUSED TRAVEL FUNDS CONTRIBUTION

Recommendation of the **City Manager** that City Council make a one time exception in the policy and allow contributions from unused travel funds for the purpose of maintaining third grade class size reduction in the Torrance Unified School District.

Councilmember Lieu reported a grass roots effort in the community to maintain third grade class size reduction and contributing the unused travel funds would allow Councilmembers to help the effort.

Councilmember Witkowski pointed out that in the past unused travel funds had been transferred to a program within the city and this would take it outside of the city element. She questioned whether something like this had been done before and Finance Director Tsao clarified that funds had been used for city sponsored events in the past but the reason for this is that the city is joined with the district and the action is within intent of city policy.

City Manager Jackson added that they tried to keep the funds as close to city programs as possible and while this is a bit of a stretch from past practices it continues the partnership.

Responding to Councilmember Witkowski, Finance Director Tsao explained that the fiscal year ends June 30 and if the item passes staff would provide the figure for unused travel funds within a day or two.

Councilmember Scotto explained that the total amount needed was \$160,000 and the Torrance Education Found had matched \$80,000. He encouraged Councilmembers to personally donate money.

Councilmember Nowatka questioned whether there were items that the school district actually paid to the city.

Finance Director Tsao explained that since the dollar amount is not that large the district would prefer that a check be sent to them.

Councilmember Nowatka commented that the donation would still be voluntary and Councilmembers may not have money left over or may chose to use the money. He indicated that while he was in favor of the motion, he is a Torrance Education Foundation board member and has already contributed a lot of money to the \$80,000 that has been raised and there are many other good programs in the city that might deserve the money. He pointed out that if one chooses not to donate the money it should not be seen as an anti-school vote.

Councilmember McIntyre encouraged other members of the Council to support the particular effort as smaller class sizes benefit children.

MOTION: Councilmember Lieu moved to accept the staff recommendation. Councilmember Scotto seconded the motion and a roll call vote reflected unanimous approval.

Councilmember Witkowsky indicated that she had donated her own personal funds.

11D. CONSOLIDATED PUBLIC SAFETY COMMUNICATIONS CENTER

Recommendation of the **City Manager, Chief of Police**, and the **Fire Chief** that City Council approve the proposed organization of the consolidated Public Safety Communications Center and the implementing of staffing revisions and additions.

Police Chief Herren provided a brief overview of the item and Captain Kreager reported that police and fire department staff had been working in collaboration with Information Technology for over a year in anticipation of consolidation on June 1, 2005. He summarized actions being taken to bring the consolidation to a reality and noted that both police and fire were in the process of procuring a Computer Aided Dispatch (CAD) System.

Deputy Chief Besse summarized the material of record discussing staffing from the police department perspective with the consolidation noting that modifications in the police department were made in order to fund the project.

Fire Chief Bongard presented charts illustrating changes to the current format and the daily average number of incidents dispatched per shift. He recommended hiring a full time public safety dispatch supervisor to solve the retention issue as part time personnel has not worked out well and he explained funding of the proposed revisions per the material of record noting that they currently have one dispatcher from midnight to 8 a.m. and additional help would be available in the co-located safety center.

Assistant City Manager Giordano pointed out additional costs associated with moving forward with the Public Safety Communications Center noting that originally it had been geared toward savings but there has been a shift in circumstances and funding for the costs must be identified. She summarized the material of record relating to funding the proposed revisions adding that estimated mall sales tax growth would provide one time only bridge funding.

Councilmember Witkowsky expressed concern with paramedic response time and Fire Chief Bongard assured her that time would not be lost with the new system nor would service be decreased. He noted that if the dispatchers are in the same room that could provide insight to other things that may be required and they would not have to call back and get police assistance.

Tom Winchester, President of the Torrance Police Officer's Association (TPOA) asserted that freezing a captain's position and eliminating lieutenant positions would have an adverse affect on their membership especially since there are members who have tested to promote and are currently on the list awaiting openings. He indicated that TPOA did not oppose the consolidation of police and fire but would not support it at the expense of sworn positions.

Martin Serna, President of the Torrance Fire Fighters Association (TFFA), reported that the fire communications center is in desperate need of additional personnel as call volume increases annually and he noted concerns with combining communications. He asked that staffing be addressed prior to co-location of the new system and indicated that they did not support the funding mechanism to attain this as it would create other problems elsewhere in public safety.

Mike Paolozzi, President of the Torrance Police Commanders Association, opposed the consolidation as it eliminates promotional positions with none of the lieutenants planning to leave. He asked the Council to vote against consolidation.

Bonnie Me Barnard, Gramercy, supported consolidation but had concerns with staffing. She related a 1991 incident when firemen responded within 3 minutes of the call and saved her life by reviving her when she stopped breathing. She expressed concern about the recommendation to eliminate a dispatcher during the graveyard shift as all other shifts have two dispatchers. She asked the Council to reconsider how to fund the project.

Responding to Councilmember Witkowski, City Manager Jackson felt that the change in personnel would help achieve the overtime and she questioned whether it would be appropriate to hold the item in the budget. City Manager Jackson related that they had been considered but they have invested in the infrastructure and are ready for the change over. He indicated that the captain and lieutenant positions could be held as a separate item but that would mean they would begin with a deficit.

Councilmember Witkowski asked about unfilled positions and City Manager Jackson indicated that the captain position is currently vacant and the lieutenant position is targeted for when and if it becomes vacant.

Councilmember Witkowski clarified that those in line to be promoted would possibly only have to wait until the budget crisis has passed and City Manager Jackson explained that was the reasoning behind freezing the position. He added that they had just taken an exam and would feel like they would be denied the opportunity of advancement if that has to wait two years and Police Chief Herren added that the lieutenant list was just two months old.

Mayor Walker commented that it was always difficult to find large amounts of money but he did not want to find it at the expense of cutting police and fire positions. He felt that the operational situation involving overtime for fire would resolve itself and he was not in favor of freezing or deleting either of the police positions. He appreciated the creative way of funding the operation but he didn't think it worked for the department and it would do more harm than good.

Councilmember Lieu shared similar concerns and noted that there was no link between the captain and lieutenant positions and the center. He supported the concept but not the funding mechanism.

Councilmember Mauno asked for a response to concerns with a single dispatcher and Fire Chief Bongard explained that there are currently two dispatchers, but before 1999 they operated with one dispatcher and decided to go to two dispatchers on duty for all shifts when they began to approach 10,000 calls per year. He reported that the call volume drops to less than one call per hour after midnight and he acknowledged occasions when two calls come in at once. Under the consolidation proposal there would be one

dispatcher but the police dispatch would have two people who could assist the fire operator.

Responding to Councilmember Mauno, Fire Chief Bongard indicated that right now they were co-locating the systems and eventually they hope to have public safety dispatchers who will know how to work both boards and when they have one CAD system it will be easier.

Councilmember McIntyre expressed concern about the lack of promotional viability in view of the fact that exams have been given or are scheduled shortly and she questioned how viable other funding options were for the \$450,000 they have to come up with.

City Manager Jackson indicated that there were other possibilities within the budget.

Councilmember Nowatka noted that when the building was designed in the 70s they were looking at combining the functions and while he acknowledged that hard decisions had to be made, he did not agree with eliminating the lieutenant position. He asked to see alternatives.

Councilmember Scotto felt the possibility of combining the two dispatch functions would enhance the graveyard shift which would create a screening effect so in theory there would be more coverage and having people in the same room means the information is immediately transmitted which can save lives. He noted that another person could be added to graveyard if necessary.

Councilmember Lieu received clarification that they could approve the consolidation with direction to staff to come up with an alternative funding mechanism.

MOTION: Councilmember Lieu moved to concur with the staff recommendation with the exception of the freezing of one police captain position and deletion of one police lieutenant position with alternative funding mechanisms to be found. Councilmember Witkowski seconded the motion and a roll call vote reflected unanimous approval.

Mayor Walker called a brief recess from 9:00 p.m. to 9:11 p.m.

11E. MODIFICATIONS RE TORRANCE COMMUNITY TRANSIT PROGRAM

The **Acting Transit Director** reaffirms and recommends that the City Council approve the following proposed program modifications to the Torrance Community Transit Program;

- 1) Establish a maximum subsidy for each ride not to exceed \$13.00;
- 2) Place a cap on the standard number of tickets per month at 16;
- 3) Evaluate requests for additional tickets on a case by case basis for a specified time period for medical reasons only, but in no case authorize more than 32 per month.

Acting Transportation Director Mills indicated the item was a follow-up to a request from the Council on May 10 to have staff request discounts from taxi companies to help offset costs to the Torrance Community Transit Program. He reported that staff had met with the three taxi companies on May 12 but they could not provide more discounts due to rising fuel costs and franchise fees, and there was a concern that driver discounts could act as a disincentive to pick up participants and result in favoring regular fares.

Councilmember Mauno questioned how requests for additional tickets for medical reasons were handled to maintain the dignity of the person and Acting Transportation Director Mills explained that requests were evaluated on a case by case basis requiring a doctor's certificate stating the reason for the request and the duration.

Responding to Mayor Walker, Acting Transportation Director Mills explained that the original report indicated they were only \$250,000 over budget but additional data is now available indicating that the project overrun is now almost \$400,000.

Responding to Councilmember Witkowsky, Acting Transportation Director Mills explained how the tiers worked within system and he noted that the proposed change would cap the maximum amount paid by the city at \$13 per ride with the rider responsible for paying the balance. He clarified that the rider currently paid charges outside the boundaries but those boundaries will be eliminated so riders can go wherever they want and can stack the tickets to use two for a \$26 fare.

Responding to Councilmember Scotto, Acting Transportation Director Mills explained that the city currently pays the full meter rate and with the proposed system the city would pay up to \$13 per ticket.

Councilmember Scotto suggested that if the amount was raised to \$15 per ticket then most riders wouldn't have to pay anything and Acting Transportation Director Mills noted that would add \$200,000 to the budget.

Councilmember McIntyre asked about the elimination of the satellite points and Acting Transportation Director Mills explained that satellite points had been designed to serve outside areas and the most popular stop is Kaiser. He noted that adding satellite points had driven up the costs and staff believed that 78% of the rides would be covered by the \$13 ticket. The city wants to encourage the use of public transportation and has started a bus buddies program to promote bus riding. He added that those seniors who are disabled can use the bus for free if they have an access services card.

Councilmember Witkowsky asked for statistics for seniors who don't use all their tickets and Acting Transportation Director Mills indicated that based on what he had seen they use them all and more. Tickets with expiration dates have been added and seniors have been encouraged not to purchase more than they need with Rainy Day tickets made available for emergency trips so that people are not left stranded.

Councilmember Witkowsky questioned what the savings would be if 14 tickets were offered instead of 16 and City Manager Jackson indicated that \$282,000 could be saved.

Councilmember Scotto pointed out that the Council had fought to raise the number of tickets available and he felt that going backwards would be a bad thing. He noted that other cities offered more and reducing the benefit to \$13 per ride was the same as raising the price of the ticket. He felt staff needed to find some other way to save money and he suggested approving the item with a \$15 maximum ticket value and finding \$122,000 somewhere else.

Mayor Walker commented that the program did a tremendous amount of good and the program is a safety net to help people on an emergency basis or get them to the

hospital but not meant to replace a spouse, child or neighbor to provide transportation. He noted that the program was originally designed for \$150,000 and has now gone way past \$1 million and it is critical to find a way to keep the expenditure as close to the \$1 million figure as possible.

Mayor Walker reiterated the importance of limiting the program to those who truly need it and not those who use it on a discretionary basis to replace the inconvenience of having someone else drive them someplace. He noted the importance of getting the senior from their house to the bus stop and to be assisted on to the bus.

MOTION: Councilmember Scotto moved to accept the staff recommendation with the change that the amount covered by the city be \$15 per ticket instead of \$13.

Councilmember Lieu acknowledged staff's concerns and noted that the program worked extremely well and they were proposing reducing a program that is very much needed. He pointed out that the Commission on Aging had come out against the proposal and he would not support any limitations put on the program at this point.

Councilmember Mauno commented that helping those with healthcare needs is the primary goal of the program not providing rides to the airport and he indicated support for the staff recommendation with the understanding that adjustments can be made if necessary.

Councilmember Witkowsky noted that 894 seniors use this service and the costs have soared from \$500,000 to well over \$1 million dollars. She felt that bus buddies would work well for some but she supported the initial bus loop that she has talked about for the past four years which would go to senior developments as transportation has to go to the places seniors go or it is not going to work. She commented that it would not have cost this much if the program would have been done three years ago and she felt a lot of money had been spent without looking at other options. She added that trolley-type transportation worked really well in other cities.

City Manager Jackson stated that staff had looked at a response bus before and would bring additional information forward about that.

Motion died for lack of a second

MOTION: Councilmember Witkowsky moved to concur with the staff recommendation. Councilmember McIntyre seconded the motion and the discussion continued.

Councilmember Scotto clarified that 6,747 people use the program and that changes would take effect on July 1, 2005.

Acting Transportation Director Mills clarified that while the Commission on Aging was not endorsing the proposal they understood the need.

Mayor Walker received clarification that that 894 disabled individuals in the city used Dial A Taxi and Acting Transportation Director Mills indicated that there were between 2,700-2800 registered users who regularly used the Dial-a-Taxi program purchasing 16 tickets the majority of the year and there are 6,000 registered users in the database.

Councilmember Lieu submitted Carol Dean's email for the record which indicated that she was against the proposal. He pointed out that the Torrance subsidy was less than what the city of Carson offered and he did not think the program was unreasonable compared to other south bay cities.

Mayor Walker pointed out that the annual cost for the Carson program is \$600,000, Culver City spends \$419,000 and Torrance is at \$1.4 million. He noted many opportunities to develop a program with a million dollar base and Acting Transportation Director Mills agreed to explore other options.

Councilmember McIntyre complimented Acting Transportation Director Mills on the thoroughness of his report and for the exploration of alternatives. She felt the program was important to everyone but the average yearly subsidy per rider is almost \$3,000 per person.

Motion carried. AYES: Councilmembers Mauno, McIntyre, Nowatka, Witkowsky, NOES: Councilmembers Lieu, Scotto and Mayor Walker.

11F. AGREEMENT RE MV TRANSPORTATION FOR MUNICIPAL AREA EXPRESS BUSES

Recommendation of the **Acting Transit Director** and the **Municipal Area Express (MAX) Policy Steering Committee** that the City Council authorize the Mayor to execute and the City Clerk to attest the attached contract services agreement with MV Transportation, Inc. for the provision of operations and maintenance services for the MAX Commuter Bus Service (RFP B2005-06) from July 1, 2005 through June 30, 2008 for a total not to exceed \$2,631,254.

Acting Transit Director Mills reported that on May 17 Council had directed staff to have the Policy Steering Committee (PSC) confirm or rescind their previous decision. The MAX PSC reaffirmed their approval of MV Transportation with the lone dissenter being the City of Los Angeles and Torrance is again asked to approve the contract services agreement with MV Transportation.

Councilmember Mauno reported that enhanced benefits had been offered as a result of the meeting and Acting Transit Director Mills clarified that would be held to the added inducements offered.

Mayor Walker felt action in delaying the item had served a good purpose and still allowed them to go forward with the system working. He felt that the individuals who had major concerns had been served by the action taken.

Councilmember Lieu questioned how the city could ensure that MV Transportation would keep their promise to protect the pensions of the bus drivers and Deputy City Attorney Sullivan indicated that those terms would be added to the contract.

Veronica Sevejos reported being a MAX Driver and she questioned why MV Transportation was offering to protect the pensions when they had refused in the beginning. Mayor Walker asserted that they had been forced to protect the pensions. Ms. Sevejos asked about those drivers who did not want to follow the contract and Deputy City Attorney Sullivan explained that they would have to get another teamsters job and work another 3 years to get the pension.

MOTION: Councilmember Witkowski moved to concur with the staff recommendation and Councilmember McIntyre seconded the motion. The discussion continued.

Responding to Councilmember Lieu, Acting Transit Director Mills explained that the lead agency prepared agendas and RFPs, the Council takes the recommendation to the PSC and the role of the Council is to execute the agreement. City Manager Jackson clarified that the city is bound by the agreement to vote affirmative on the contract and Deputy City Attorney Sullivan added that the Council would be executing the contract for the board as lead agency.

Councilmember McIntyre wanted to make sure that the letter of May 17 was incorporated into the contract as part of the motion.

Motion carried. Ayes: Councilmembers Mauno, McIntyre, Nowatka, Scotto, and Mayor Walker; Noes: Councilmember Lieu.

Councilmember Lieu commented that he had opposed the item because of the way it is structured which puts the Council in an untenable position. He indicated that he wanted to see the agreement reconfigured as a joint powers agreement.

*

The Torrance Redevelopment Agency met from 9:56 p.m. to 9:57 p.m.

*

16. ORAL COMMUNICATIONS

16A. Councilmember Lieu congratulated city staff and departments for an outstanding Armed Forces Day Parade.

16B. Councilmember Lieu requested staff look into the availability of modifying the MAX contract with Council concurrence. Councilmember Scotto pointed out that the contract goes until 2008 and Mayor Walker added that an overview of the management system was approved in January until 2008. Councilmember Scotto noted that would be imposing changes on another council and Mayor Walker had no objection to staff taking a look at it noting that no council is bound by the actions of a previous council so it could be reviewed again. City Attorney Fellows clarified that the organizational structure of MAX could be changed at any time if seven member parties agree and he agreed to explore the matter and return with options.

16C. Councilmember Lieu reported that the State Superintendent of Education, Jack O'Connell, had recently singled out the Torrance Unified School District as the City Council had voted in favor of aid to the school district.

16D. Councilmember Lieu noted that Assemblymember Mike Gordon was ill with cancer and his son had made wristbands available for anyone who wants to show support. Free wristbands are available for pick up at the front counter at City Hall.

16E. Councilmember Mauno expressed pride in his Mike Gordon wristband and noted that he believed in miracles.

16F. Councilmember Mauno felt it healthy to challenge how things are done in government and he supported a re-examination the MAX agreement.

16G. Councilmember Mauno congratulated Councilmembers Lieu and Scotto who served on the Armed Forces Day committee as well as all city employees who did a fantastic job on Armed Forces Day.

16H. Councilmember Mauno reported attending the police memorial service and personally thanked the city's police officers for their protection and for making the community safe.

16I. Councilmember McIntyre echoed Councilmember Mauno's comments noting that the city works hard as a unit and everything was stellar.

16J. Councilmember McIntyre pointed out an article in last week's New York Times regarding a large cancer research study for women conducted by Dr. House at Torrance Harbor UCLA. The study concluded that a successful treatment of a disease that decimates women throughout the globe is simply maintenance of a low fat diet.

16K, Councilmember Nowatka seconded the Armed Forces parade comments and he thanked Councilmember Mauno for his comments regarding Torrance Police.

16L. Councilmember Nowatka encouraged energy conservation and reported attending an Energy Summit in El Segundo at Raytheon where he learned that estimates of the energy demands for 2006 have already been exceeded.

16M. Councilmember Nowatka congratulated CitiCABLE 3 for winning three programming awards.

16N. Councilmember Scotto echoed congratulations for CitiCABLE 3.

16O. Councilmember Scotto reported on the success of the Armed Forces Parade events and he congratulated Police Chief Herren, Captain New, Deputy Chief Besse, Lieutenant Smith, Lieutenant Matsuda, Brenda Felt and city employees including Ian Tanza. He reported that it was the most attended parade they ever had with between 60,000-80,000 people on the parade route.

16P. Councilmember Witkowsky enjoyed the Armed Forces Day Parade which supports the troops and helps the youth understand what freedom is all about. She found the parade uplifting and enjoyed the fly bys and helicopters. She thanked firefighters, Community Emergency Response Team (CERT) volunteers and TARA Torrance Amateur Radio Association volunteers as well.

16Q. Councilmember Witkowsky thanked TME AFSCME Local 1117 for their donation of \$500 to the parade.

16R. Mayor Walker reported throwing out the first pitch at Dodger Stadium and he thanked Torrance residents for Torrance Day at Dodger Stadium.

16T. Bonnie Mae Barnard, Gramercy, read her comments into the record:

"Good evening Councilmembers, people of Torrance in the audience and those of you watching via television. I'm very excited about my opportunity to offer a book on the history of the City of Torrance. Although I have taught English for the last twelve years, have a

Masters Degree in writing, and have been a contributing author previously, this will be my first solo published work.

I'd like to take this opportunity to publicly thank Janet Payne and Debbie Hayes of the Torrance Historical Society for giving me the opportunity. I'm a relatively new homeowner in the City of Torrance, having only purchased the Zamperini House in 2000. However, in the 25 years that I have rented in Torrance, I've always dreamed of owning a home in Historic Old Torrance. Finally five years ago that desire became a reality. Now this author is in the fast track to learn everything I can about this wonderful city and place it in a book.

I would like to thank Janet Payne and Debbie Hayes of the Torrance Historical Society for giving me this opportunity. Jerry Roberts of Arcadia Publishing first went to them for the idea of authoring this book. Janet tells me that they declined because they are working on a book that will come out in seven years, in time for our 100th birthday of our city. I think that's a grand idea and I hope everyone will purchase a copy of that book.

I don't know if they personally recommended me, but I do know it was that decision, and a copy of the Old Torrance Telegram that opened the door for Mr. Roberts of Arcadia Publishing to approach me. My book will come out this year, in time for Christmas and I hope that everyone will purchase copies for themselves and to give as gifts.

I would also like to thank the board of the Torrance Historical Society which has decided to allow me to use six photos archived in the Museum, photos that have already been in previous publications.

I want to take this opportunity to ask the people of Torrance to help me write this book. In a moment I'll give you my contact information so you can write it down or you can watch the replay of this council meeting.

I'll do the research and writing but I need your photos in order to make this book a reality. And, I'd like to hear your story, or your parents' story or grandparents' story that goes with the photos.

The book will be in Arcadia's format. The format is like this one. A page of history for each chapter, followed by many pages of pictures with captions. In fact, you can purchase books like this on other cities like Culver City and Daly City at our local bookstores. My book needs about 200 photos and/or postcards.

It will be available for purchase in time for Christmas at Borders, Barnes & Noble and other book stores. To clarify, Save Historic Old Torrance will not receive the proceeds. I personally will receive a royalty as the author. Because I believe so strongly in preserving the City of Torrance's historical landmarks, streetscapes and architectural treasures for ourselves and our grandchildren, and because I believe that our physical history portrayed in those treasures provides all Torrance residents with a sense of place and an attachment to the city, because of that belief, I have decided to give a portion of those royalties to Save Historic Old Torrance.

I'm asking the people of Torrance to dig out those old pictures stored in a box or an album and allow me to scan them and use them in this upcoming pictorial history of Torrance. I need them right away. I have a July deadline to meet. I'll come to your home or business with my laptop and portable scanner, so your pictures won't need to leave your possession.

In order to have the book out in time for Christmas, I need the photos as quickly as possible. I don't want that picture of you, your parents or grandparents to miss out on the chance to be published so everyone can get a glimpse of life as it was in the City of Torrance. Won't you take a moment to dig out those old photos? I want this to be a community book. A book that is about the people of Torrance doing what they do in Torrance: working, living, and playing. That means I want those pictures of events in the city, of cars and of the bridge, of the earthquake, the flood, of the church or scout activity,

or your house, of your business, of your street. You get the idea. Don't rule out that old picture, let me decide. You just might find it in the newest book about our city. And of course everyone whose picture is used in the book will be given credit and acknowledged. Contact me through Save Historic Old Torrance at www.savehistoricaltorrance.com or by phone 320-0239. To read more about the project pick up a copy of the latest edition of the Old Torrance Telegram at the library, here at City Hall, at the Fosters Freeze or any of the downtown Old Torrance businesses. Thanks again to all the people of Torrance. I couldn't do this without you."

16U. Newt Young, Hickory Avenue, reporting coming to speak on item 11C but the vote was taken so quickly there was no call for audience participation. He felt that reallocation for unused travel funds to the school district set a precedent that is not healthy and he pointed out a policy for controlling the disposition of the funds for material, supplies, special events, books, and they could have gone to Armed Forces Day parade.

17. EXECUTIVE SESSION

Considered previously.

18. ADJOURNMENT

At 10:22 p.m., the meeting was adjourned to Tuesday, June 7, 2005, at 6:00 p.m. for an executive session, with the regular meeting commencing at 7:00 p.m. in the Council Chambers. **Tuesday, May 31 will be a Council dark night.**

Attest:	<u>/s/ Dan Walker</u> Mayor of the City of Torrance
<u>/s/ Sue Herbers</u>	
Sue Herbers, CMC City Clerk of the City of Torrance	Approved on September 20, 2005